

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA**

STATE OF OKLAHOMA, et al.,)	
)	
Plaintiff,)	
)	
v.)	Case No. 4:05-CV-00329-TCK-SAJ
)	
TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,)	
)	
Defendants.)	

**STATE OF OKLAHOMA’S MOTION FOR ORDER IMPLEMENTING AND
ENFORCING RULES FOR DISCOVERY OF ELECTRONICALLY STORED
INFORMATION AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT THEREOF**

COMES NOW the Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, *ex rel.* W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma, and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment, C. Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma under CERCLA, (hereinafter “the State”) pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26 and 34 and Local Civil Rule 7.2 and hereby respectfully requests that the Court enter an Order implementing and enforcing the rules for discovery of electronically stored information as set forth in more detail herein and in the accompanying proposed order.

At the urging of the State, counsel for the parties have met on two separate occasions in an effort to reach an agreement as to the process by which the exchange of electronically stored information (“ESI”) should take place. Despite a detailed plan for ESI production proposed by the State prior to the initial meeting and discussed at length, no agreement has been reached. A true and correct copy of the proposed plan titled “Proposed Electronic Discovery Meeting Check List” is attached hereto and marked Exhibit 1. One of the main points of disagreement is the unwillingness of Defendants to agree to apply provisions of the proposed Fed. R. Civ. P. 26, 33, and 34 prior to their effective date of December 1, 2006. The State hereby requests that the

Court enter an Order which essentially directs the parties to implement and apply those procedures, or procedures similar thereto, immediately to promote the just and efficient handling of ESI production. In further support of this Motion, the State states the following:

In 1970, the Rule 34 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure was revised to include within the term “documents” data compilations which can be obtained only through the use of detection devices, *i.e.* computer equipment. *See* Advisory Committee Note of 1970 Amendment to Rule 34(a). Even in 1970, the Advisory Committee knew that “[i]n many instances, this means that respondent will have to supply a print-out of computer data.” *Id.*

Fast forward to today, thirty-six years later, with the many advances in technology, the need for defined procedures for the production of ESI is ever-increasing. The recent amendment to Rules 26, 33 and 34, effective in December, 2006, will do much to define and focus parties on the process that must be adhered to in today’s increasingly paperless age. Litigants already recognize the need for discovery of ESI. Production requests generally and regularly define “documents” to include electronically kept and maintained information. Even if not specifically so defined, parties regularly request such information separately.

Under the new federal rules parties will be required to meet and confer regarding provisions for disclosure or discovery of ESI. ESI will be required disclosure material in initial Rule 26 disclosures. And, when specifically requested, the requesting party may specify the form in which ESI is to be produced. In the instant case, written discovery is progressing. Much of the requests for information will necessarily involve production of ESI. Both the State and numerous Defendants have pending discovery responses due within a short period of time, prior to December 1, 2006. The definition of “documents” in the outstanding discovery requests includes ESI. The State suggested that the parties apply the new discovery rules prior to the

effective date, but Defendants have refused. The State requests that the Court enter an Order setting forth the procedure by which the parties will meet and confer and arrive at a process for production of ESI which implements most if not all the guidelines set forth by and to be implemented within the new Fed. R. Civ. P. 26, 33 and 34 effective December 1, 2006 as set forth in the accompanying proposed Order attached hereto as Exhibit "A". The State is confident that this process will assist the parties toward efficiently retrieving the ESI in a workable format for access by all concerned.

WHEREFORE, the State prays that this Court enter an Order implementing and enforcing rules for discovery of electronically stored information prior to the effective date of the most recent amendments to the Fed. R. Civ. P. 26, 33 and 34.

Respectfully Submitted,

W. A. Drew Edmondson, OBA 2628
Attorney General
Kelly H. Burch, OBA #17067
J. Trevor Hammons, OBA #20234
Assistant Attorneys General
State of Oklahoma
2300 North Lincoln Boulevard, Suite 112
Oklahoma City, OK 73105
(405) 521-3921

C. Miles Tolbert, OBA #14822
Secretary of the Environment
State of Oklahoma
3800 North Classen
Oklahoma City, Ok 73118
(405) 530-8800

/s Richard T. Garren

M. David Riggs, OBA #7583
Joseph P. Lennart, OBA #5371
Richard T. Garren, OBA #3253

Douglas A. Wilson, OBA #13128
Sharon K. Weaver, OBA #19010
Riggs, Abney, Neal, Turpen,
Orbison & Lewis
502 West Sixth Street
Tulsa, OK 74119
(918) 587-3161

James Randall Miller, OBA #6214
David P. Page, OBA #6852
Louis Werner Bullock, OBA #1305
Miller Keffer & Bullock
222 South Kenosha
Tulsa, Ok 74120-2421
(918) 743-4460

Frederick C. Baker, (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Elizabeth C. Ward, (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Motley Rice LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
P. O. Box 1792
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465
(843) 216-9000

William H. Narwold, (admitted *pro hac vice*)
Motley Rice LLC
One Corporate Center
20 Church Street, 17th Floor
Hartford, CT 06103
(860) 882-1682

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 2nd day of October, 2006, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the following:

- Jo Nan Allen jonanallen@yahoo.com, bacaviola@yahoo.com
- Robert Earl Applegate hm@holdenokla.com, rapplegate@holdenokla.com
- Frederick C. Baker fbaker@motleyrice.com, fhmorgan@motleyrice.com
- Tim Keith Baker tbakerlaw@sbcglobal.net
- Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsgw.com, jdavis@mwsgw.com
- Douglas L. Boyd dboyd31244@aol.com
- Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com, lphillips@cwlaw.com

- Paula M Buchwald pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com
- Louis Werner Bullock lbullock@mkblaw.net, nhodge@mkblaw.net
- Michael Lee Carr hm@holdenokla.com mcarr@holdenokla.com
- Bobby Jay Coffman bcoffman@loganlowry.com
- Lloyd E. Cole, Jr colelaw@alltel.net, gloriaeubanks@alltel.net,
amy_colelaw@alltel.net
- Angela Diane Cotner AngelaCotnerEsq@yahoo.com
- Reuben Davis rdavis@boonesmith.com
- John Brian DesBarres mrjdbd@msn.com, JohnD@wcalaw.com
- W A Drew Edmondson fc_docket@oag.state.ok.us,
drew_edmondson@oag.state.ok.us, suzy_thrash@oag.state.ok.us
- Delmar R Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com, kcarney@faegre.com,
qsperrazza@faegre.com
- John R Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com, vmorgan@cwlaw.com
- William Bernard Federman wfederman@aol.com; law@federmanlaw.com,
ngb@federmanlaw.com
- Bruce Wayne Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com, lcla@cwlaw.com
- Ronnie Jack Freeman jfreeman@grahamfreeman.com
- Dorothy Sharon Gentry sgentry@riggsabney.com, jzielinski@riggsabney.com
- Robert W George robert.george@kutakrock.com, donna.sinclair@kutakrock.com
- Tony Michael Graham tgraham@grahamfreeman.com,
- James Martin Graves jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com
- Michael D Graves mgraves@hallestill.com, jspring@hallestill.com,
smurphy@hallestill.com
- Thomas James Grever tgrever@lathropgage.com
- Jennifer Stockton Griffin jgriffin@lathropgage.com
- Carrie Griffith griffithlawoffice@yahoo.com
- John Trevor Hammons thammons@oag.state.ok.us,
Trevor_Hammons@oag.state.ok.us, Jean_Burnett@oag.state.ok.us
- Michael Todd Hembree hembreeawl@aol.com, traesmom_md@yahoo.com
- Theresa Noble Hill thillcourts@rhodesokla.com, mnave@rhodesokla.com
- Philip D Hixon Phixon@jpm-law.com,
- Mark D Hopson mhopson@sidley.com, joraker@sidley.com
- Kelly S. Hunter Burch fc_docket@oag.state.ok.us, kelly_burch@oag.state.ok.us,
jean_burnett@oag.state.ok.us
- Thomas Janer SCMJ@sbcglobal.net; tjaner@cableone.net; lanaphillips@sbcglobal.net
- Stephen L Jantzen sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com, mantene@ryanwhaley.com,
loelke@ryanwhaley.com
- Mackenzie Lea Hamilton Jessie_maci.tbakerlaw@sbcglobal.net,
tbakerlaw@sbcglobal.net; macijessie@yahoo.com
- Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com, jintermill@faegre.com; bnallick@faegre.com
- Jay Thomas Jorgensen jjorgensen@sidley.com
- Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee kklee@faegre.com, mlokken@faegre.com
- Raymond Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com, dianna@kiralaw.com; niccilay@cox.net

- Nicole Marie Longwell Nlongwell@jpm-law.com, ahubler@jpm-law.com
- Dara D. Mann dmann@faegre.com, kolmscheid@faegre.com
- Teresa Brown Marks teresa.marks@arkansasag.gov, dennis.hansen@arkansasag.com
- Linda C Martin lmartin@dsda.com, mschooling@dsda.com
- Archer Scott McDaniel Smcdaniel@jpm-law.com, jwaller@jpm-law.com
- Robert Park Medearis, Jr medearislawfirm@sbcglobal.net
- James Randall Miller rmiller@mkblaw.net, smilata@mkblaw.net,
clagrone@mkblaw.net
- Charles Livingston Moulton charles.moulton@arkansasag.gov,
Kendra.jones@arkansasag.gov
- Robert Allen Nance rnance@riggsabney.com, jzielinski@riggsabney.com
- William H Narwold bnarwold@motleyrice.com
- John Stephen Neas steve_neas@yahoo.com
- George W Owens gwo@owenslawfirmpc.com, ka@owenslawfirmpc.com
- David Phillip Page dpage@mkblaw.net, smilata@mkblaw.net
- Michael Andrew Pollard mpollard@boonesmith.com, kmiller@boonesmith.com
- Marcus N Ratcliff mratcliff@lswsl.com, sshanks@lswsl.com
- Robert Paul Redemann rredemann@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net
- Melvin David Riggs driggs@riggsabney.com
- Randall Eugene Rose rer@owenslawfirmpc.com, ka@owenslawfirmpc.com
- Patrick Michael Ryan pryan@ryanwhaley.com, jmickle@ryanwhaley.com;
kshocks@ryanwhaley.com
- Laura E. Samuelson lsamuelson@lswsl.com; lsamuelson@gmail.com
- Robert E Sanders rsanders@youngwilliams.com,
- David Charles Senger dsenger@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net
- Jennifer Faith Sherrill jfs@federmanlaw.com, law@federmanlaw.com;
ngb@federmanlaw.com
- Michelle B. Skeens hm@holdenokla.com mskeens@holdenokla.com
- William Francis Smith bsmith@grahamfreeman.com
- Monte W Strout strout@xtremeinet.net
- Colin Hampton Tucker chtucker@rhodesokla.com, scottom@rhodesokla.com
- John H Tucker jtuckercourts@rhodesokla.com
- Kenneth Edward Wagner kwagner@lswsl.com, sshanks@lswsl.com
- David Alden Walls wallsd@wwhwlaw.com, burnett@wwhwlaw.com
- Elizabeth C. Ward lward@motleyrice.com
- Sharon K. Weaver sweaver@riggsabney.com, lpearson@riggsabney.com
- Timothy K Webster twebster@sidley.com, jwedeking@sidley.com;
ahorner@sidley.com
- Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com,
- Dale Kenyon Williams, Jr kwilliams@hallestill.com, jspring@hallestill.com;
smurphy@hallestill.com
- Edwin Stephen Williams steve.williams@youngwilliams.com
- J Ron Wright ron@wsfw-ok.com, susan@wsfw-ok.com
- Lawrence W Zeringue lzeringue@pmrlaw.net, scouch@pmrlaw.net

N. Lance Bryan; lbryan@dsda.com
Gary V. Weeks, gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com

I hereby certify that on this 2nd day of October, 2006, I served the foregoing document by U.S. Postal Service on the following:

Jim Bagby
Rr 2, Box 1711
Westville, Ok 74965

Gordon W. Clinton
Susann Clinton
23605 S Goodnight Ln
Welling, Ok 74471

Eugene Dill
P O Box 46
Cookson, Ok 74424

Marjorie Garman
5116 Highway 10
Tahlequah, Ok 74464

James C Geiger
address unknown

Thomas C. Green
Sidley, Austin, Brown & Wood LLP
1501 K. Street NW
Washington DC 20005

G Craig Heffington
20144 W Sixshooter Rd
Cookson, Ok 74427

Cherrie House
William House
P. O. Box 1097
Stillwell, Ok 74960

James Lamb, Dorothy Jean Lamb &

James R. & Dorothy Jean Lamb Dba Strayhorn Landing Marina
Route 1, Box 253
Gore, Ok 74435

Jerry M. Maddux
Selby, Connor, Maddox, Janer
PO Box Z
Bartlesville, OK 74005-5025

Doris Mares
P O Box 46
Cookson, Ok 74424

Donna S Parker
Richard E Parker
34996 S 502 Rd
Park Hill, Ok 74451

Kenneth Spencer
Jane T. Spencer
Rt 1, Box 222
Kansas, Ok 74347

Robin L. Wofford
Rt 2, Box 370
Watts, Ok 74964

/s/ Richard T. Garren